Common elements within the writings of Gregory of Nyssa and Dionysius the Areopagite

— Dr. Elena Ene D-Vasilescu*

ABSTRACT

The common elements to be found in the works of Gregory of Nyssa and Dionysius the Areopagite are as follows: 1) the existence of three main stages of spiritual life; 2) the affirmation that, from an ontological point of view, evil does not exist; 3) the belief in the actuality of free will; 4) intimations that the progress of the soul – *epektasis* – continues in the afterlife, and 5) analogous conceptions regarding the creation of the world.

In this text I will only refer to the first two of those similarities. I need to underline that the perspectives of the two authors on the above issues are not identical in every regard; they agree on those in principle, but on some aspects of them each has a specific view.

Key words: Gregory of Nyssa - Dionysius the Areopagite - Evil - Free Will - Epektasis - Creation of the world

RESUMEN

Los elementos comunes que se encuentran en las obras de Gregorio de Nisa y Dionisio Areopagita son los siguientes 1) la existencia de tres etapas principales de la vida espiritual; 2) la afirmación de que, desde un punto de vista ontológico, el mal no existe; 3) la creencia en la actualidad del libre albedrío; 4) las insinuaciones de que el progreso del alma -la epektasis- continúa en la otra vida, y 5) las concepciones análogas sobre la creación del mundo.

En este texto sólo me referiré a las dos primeras de esas similitudes. Debo subrayar que las perspectivas de los dos autores sobre las cuestiones mencionadas no son idénticas en todos los aspectos; en principio están de acuerdo, pero en algunos aspectos cada uno tiene una visión específica.

Palabras clave: Gregorio de Nissa – Dionisio el Aeropagita – Mal – Líbero arbitrio – Epektasis – Creación del mundo

The common elements to be found in the works of Gregory of Nyssa and Dionysius the Areopagite are as follows: 1) the existence of three main stages of spiritual life; 2) the affirmation that, from an ontological point of view, evil does not exist; 3) the belief in the actuality of free will; 4) intimations that the progress of the soul – *epe*-

* University of Oxford.

ktasis – continues in the afterlife, and 5) analogous conceptions regarding the creation of the world.

In this text I will only refer to the first two of those similarities. I need to underline that the perspectives of the two authors on the above issues are not identical in every regard; they agree on those in principle, but on some aspects of them each has a specific view.

The main stages of spiritual development:

1) Concerning the first commonality to be found in the texts of Nyssen and the Syrian this consists in the belief that the evolution of the human soul undergoes three stages. These are as follows: purification, illumination, and union with the Divine ($\hat{\epsilon}v\omega\sigma\iota\varsigma/$ *henosis*). The most elaborated explanations in the works of the two authors focus on purification and union hence I will also concentrate on those. The same three stages were suggested earlier in Origen's texts.¹ (As we know Adamantius also have a complex position on the notion of evil and suffering, which for him needs to be experienced in order for the soul to ascend to God; *De Principiis/On First Principles*²). With regard to the development of the soul, the Alexandrian believed that it undergoes purification in paradise (which for Origen was a physical location) before going up to the higher heaven (*First principles*, 2. 11.6; *Against Celsius* 7. 39). For instance, this is what he says in *First principles*, 2. 11.6: "I think the souls as they depart from this life will remain in the

¹ For instance, Origen, *The Commentary of Origen on S. John's Gospel*, edited by Alan England Brooke, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011, vol. 1, Book II. 1-3, pp. 56-58; Origen, *On first principles* [henceforth *De Princ.* in the body of the text]. See "Peri archon"/De Principiis, *Patrologiae Cursus Completus Series Graeca*, J.-P. Migne (ed.), Paris: Imprimerie Catholique, 1857, vol. 11, cols. 115A-414A. Of course, this is abbreviated 'PG'; what we shall use henceforth. The translation I shall use *On first principles*, translation and notes, George William Butterworth, Introduction to the TORCH edition by Henri de Lubac, London, New York: Harper and Row, 1973; Gloucester, Massachusetts: Peter Smith Publishers, 1973. The Alexandrian has intimations about the three stages in the development of the soul, for instance in Book I, ch. 5, pp. 50-51; Book IV, ch. 1, p. 257, and Book II, ch.9, pp. 130-131. See also Origen, *On First Principles*, trans. John Behr, Oxford (from Rufinus's translation): Oxford University Press, 2019; and Phillip Schaff (ed.), *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, vol. 4: Fathers of the Third Century: Tertullian, Part Fourth; Minucius Felix; Commodian; Origen, Parts First and Second (ANFO4), Edinburg: T&T Clark, originally published in 1885; there is a new edition (on line) of it thus: "Complete Ante-Nicene & Nicene and Post-Nicene Church Fathers", London: Catholic Way Publishing, 2016.

See comments in G. Christopher Stead, "Individual Personality in Origen and the Cappadocian Fathers", within the book Bianchi Von Ugo and Henri Crouzel (eds.), *Arché e Telos: L' antropologia di Origene e di Grigorio di Nissa. Analisi storico-religiosa* (Atti del Colloquio Milano 17-19 maggio 1979), *Studia Patristica Mediolanensia* 12, Mailand: Vita e Pensiero, 1981: 170-191; Mark S. M. Scott: *Journey Back to God: Origen on the Problem of Evil*, Academy Series, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015.

² Origen, *De Principiis* (*De Princ.*),, and *Against Celsius* within *Contra Celsum*, edited by Henri Chadwick, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1953; the digital edition 2003. Origen, *De Principiis*, edited by P. Koetschau, Leipzig: Hinrichs, 1913, *On First Principles*, translation and notes, G. W. Butterworth, Introduction to the TORCH edition Henri de Lubac, Gloucester, Massachusetts: Peter Smith Publishers, 1973, 2011; and Origen, *On First Principles*, translator John Behr (from Rufinus's trans.), Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019. For comments on Adamantius's position see M. S. M. Scott, *Journey Back to God: Origen on the Problem of Evil.*

same place situated on the earth, which the divine scripture calls 'paradise'";³ (*First principles*, 2. 11.6).

There have been various interpretations concerning the manner in which Adamantius conceived of Eden: Peter Martens summarizes those. He chiefly and rightly argues that since, for Origen, the soul's purification in the paradise precedes her ascent through the heavenly spheres, it does not have an incorporeal reality, but a physical one.⁴ Epiphanius of Salamis (c. 310/320-403), who, as is known, was the first to contradict Origen's ideas - in the Panarion (Refutatio Omnium Haeresium/Refutation of all the Heresies⁵) – does not refer specifically to the above-mentioned aspect of Adamantius' thought (if he did, perhaps he might have agreed with the three stages).

Gregory of Nyssa elaborates further on the position the Alexandrian held on lustration, illumination, and unification, and according to Jean Danielou the following: "is the familiar pattern in Gregory of Nyssa's work: purification ('light'); contemplation ('cloud'); [and union ('darkness')".⁶ According to Paul Rorem, the history of this classification "may involve Origen's adaptation of some Stoic or Middle Platonic"⁷ ideas.

This is, for instance, what Nyssen says with regard to the first stage of the development of the soul in "Homily 3". 24 from the series *Homilies on the Song of Songs*:

προφανέντων ἐστέρων καὶ τοῦ ὑπαυγἀσταντος ὂρθρου τὴν λαμπηδόνα.

κάκεῖνα μὲν πὰντα καθαρσίων τινῶν καὶ περιρραντηρίων δύναμιν ἑχει, δἱ ῶν ὰφαγνισθεῖσαι αἱ ψυχαὶ πρὸς τὴν ὑποδοχἠν τῶν θείων παρασκευάζονται, ἐστι μετουσία αύτοῦ τοῦ θεοῦ

λόγου διά τῆς ἰδίας φωνῆς μεταδιδόντος τὦ ἀκούοντι τῆς

7 P. Rorem, A Commentary, p. 59.

³ Origen, *De Princ.* and *Against Celsius* in *Contra Celsum*, edited by Henri Chadwick, p. 403. On other places in Origen's work where he mentions the paradise see C. H. Bammel, "Adam in Origen", in *The Making of Orthodoxy. Essays in Honour of Henry Chadwick*, ed. R. D. Williams, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989, pp. 62-93.

⁴ Peter Martens, "Origen's doctrine of Pre-Existence and the Opening Chapters of Genesis", *Zeitschrift für Antike Christentums* 16 (2013), pp. 536-538. Origen speaks about the reality of paradise in *First principles*, 2. 11.6; *Against Celsius* 7. 39. On the subtleties and apparent consistencies of his position, in addition to Martens, see also C. H. Bammel, "Adam in Origen", in *The Making of Orthodoxy. Essays in Honour of Henry Chadwick*, ed. R. D. Williams, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989, pp. 62-93.

⁵ Epiphanius of Salamis, *The Panarion of Epiphanius of Salamis*, 64.2 edited and translated by Frank Williams, Books II and III. *De Fide*, second, revised edition, Leiden, Boston: Brill, 1994, new edition 2013, series Nag Hammadi texts and the Bible. A synopsis and index, vol. 79, Book II, pp. 134-214; and *Ancoratus* 62

See also Epiphanius of Salamis, *Panarion* (De Heresium) and *Ancoratus/Άγκυρωτός*, edited by K. Holl, in GCS (*Die Griechischen Christlichen Schriftsteller der ersten drei Jahrhunderte*, Leipzig: Hinrichs, 1915-1933, vols. 1-3. (Epiphanius of Salamis, *Ancoratus*, translated by Young Richard Kim, Washington, DC: The Catholic University of America, 2014).

⁶ Paul Rorem mentions this is *Pseudo-Dionysius. A* Commentary, New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993, p. 59. So far, I could not find this quotation in the works Jean Danielou.

άκηράτου δυνάμεως την κοινωνίαν.

kaì ὦσπερ ἐπὶ τοῦ ὅρους εινᾶ προπαρασκευασθεἴς τοῖς καθαρσίοις ὁ'/ Ἰσραὴλ ἐν ἡμέραις δύο τῇ τρίτῃ κατὰ τὸν ὅρθρον ἀειοῦται τῆς θεοφανείας οὐκέτι περὶ τὲν πλύσιν τῶν ἱματιων ἂσχολος ὣν, ἀλλ' αὐτον δεχόμενος ἐμφανῶς τὸν θεόν, οὖ χάριν τὸν τῆς ψυχῆς ῥύπον διὰ τῶν

προλαβόντων καθαρσίων ἀπεπλύνατο, οῦτω καὶ νῦν ἡ ἐν τοῖς φθάσασι λόροις γεγενημένητῶν προοιμίων τοῦ Ἀισματος τῶν Ἀισμάτων θεωρία κατὰ.

...The souls that have been purified are ready for the reception of the divine. They constitute a participation in the Godhead itself, since the divine Word is his own voice that confers on the hearer a fellowship with the undefiled Power. And just as Israel was prepared for two days in advance via rituals of purification and then, at the beginning of the third day, was considered worthy of the theophany, being no longer engaged with the cleansing of garments but openly receiving God himself, for whose sake the soul's dirt had been cleansed by the earliest purifications.⁸

Also, in his *Life of Moses*, using the biblical account as a parable of the Christian spiritual ascent, he describes how the meeting with God occurs "in the cloud", i.e., without the help of created vision. Such an encounter is possible because God is totally invisible and incomprehensible to the created eye, and inaccessible to the created mind. He is, nevertheless, seen and perceived by man, when man, by baptismal and ascetic purification, by effort and virtues, is enabled to acquire "spiritual senses," which allow him to perceive, through communion in Christ and the Holy Spirit, the One who is beyond creation.⁹

Gregory describes how Moses instructed people concerning the process of undergoing purification, which the Cappadocian calls "a most secret initiation". This is what he affirms: "The divine power itself by marvels beyond description initiated all the people and their leader himself in the following manner. The people were ordered beforehand to keep themselves from defilements of all kinds which pertain to both soul and body and to purify themselves by

⁸ Gregory of Nyssa, "Homily 3", Ekkehard Mülenberg and Giulio Maspero (eds.), *In canticum canticorum*, in *Gregorii Nysseni Opera Online*, vol. 24; general editor Werner Jaeger, consulted online on 22 June 2020, <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/2214-8728_gnoo_aGNO_24_t</u>, translation mine adapted from *Homilies on the Song of Songs*, trans. with an Introduction and Notes by Richard A. Norris Jr., Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2012; Homily 3, in Greek on p. 78, commentary in English, pp. 79, 81.

⁹ Gregory of Nyssa/Gregorii Nysseni, "De Vita Moysis pentecosten", in Ekkehard Mülenberg and Giulio Maspero (eds.), *Gregorii Nysseni Opera Online*, vol. 25, general editor for the hardback version Werner Jaeger, consulted online on 22 June 2020 http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/2214-8728_gnoo_aGNO_25_t; see also GNO. 7. 1, Leiden: Brill, first printed in 1964, reprinted 1991. In English: Gregory of Nyssa, *The Life of Moses*, trans. Abraham J. Malhherbe and Everett Ferguson, Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1978, p. 36; reprint Harper Collins Publishers in 2006. Also Gregory of Nyssa/Grégoire de Nysse, *La vie de Moïse*, edited by Jean Daniélou, Paris: Éditions du Cerf, the third edition revised and corrected, 1968, pp. 44-326; and Ann Conway-Jones, *Gregory of Nyssa's Tabemacle Imagery in its Jewish and Christian Contexts*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014.

certain lustrations; (Book I, 42; p. 42).¹⁰

Gregory of Nyssa, as we shall see, also Pseudo-Dionysius, calls the highest stage of the human development, the union with the divine, 'darkness'. Gregory does it in *The Life* of Moses. This is how he introduces it by the example of the prophet's forty day experience on Mount Sinai:

> Then the clear light of the atmosphere was darkened so that the mountain became invisible, wrapped in a dark cloud. A fire shining out of the darkness presented a fearful sight to those who saw it. It hovered all around the sides of the mountain so that everything which one could see smouldered with the smoke from the surrounding fire. Moses led the people to the slope, not without fear himself at the sight. [...] The manifestation was of such a nature that it not only caused consternation in their souls through what they saw but it also struck fear in them through what they heard. A terrible sound ripped down from above upon everything below. [...]. This sound was sharp and clear, the air articulating the word by divine power without using organs of speech. The word was not articulated

without purpose but was laying down divine ordinances. As the sound drew nearer, it became louder, and the trumpet surpassed itself, the successive sounds exceeding in volume the preceding ones.¹¹

At the end of this encounter, 'grown in knowledge', Moses declared that he had seen God in the darkness. What is most interesting in this Scriptural story is that within a darkness as that which enveloped Moses "The eye is not dimmed nor does the person age [...] And the person who by every means achieves incorruption in his whole life admits no corruption in himself. For he who has truly come to be in the image of God and who has in no way turned aside from the divine character bears in himself its distinguishing marks and shows in all things his conformity to the archetype; he beautifies his own soul with what is incorruptible, unchangeable, and shares in no evil at all"; Book II, 318).¹²

On the basis on this description *inter alia* Hans Boersma rightly assesses Gregory's ecclesiology to be "thoroughly anagogical", i. e. 'negative'/of the ascent. Paraphrasing Ps 23 (24) he considers that the "the aim of the sacraments [in the Church] is ascension, along with Christ, onto the mountain

¹⁰ Gregorii Nysseni, "De Vita Moysis pentecosten", Book I, 42, in E. Mülenberg and G. Maspero (eds.), GNO 25; general editor for the hardback version Werner Jaeger, consulted online on 22 June 2020 http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/2214-8728_gnoo_aGNO_25_t.6.

¹¹ Gregorii Nysseni, "De Vita Moysis pentecosten", Book I, 42, in Mülenberg and Maspero (eds.), GNO 25, consulted online on 22 June 2020 http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/2214-8728_gnoo_aGNO_25_t.

¹² Gregorii Nysseni, "De Vita Moysis pentecosten", Book II, 318, in Mülenberg and Maspero (eds.), GNO 25; consulted online on 22 June 2020 http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/2214-8728_gnoo_aGNO_25_t.

of the presence of God."¹³ John McGuckin also evaluates that the way "the mystical ascent of the *Nous*" in presented by Gregory in the *Life of Moses* "is exactly what the ancient Church from earliest times took as a symbol of its own worship."¹⁴

Dionysius the Pseudo-Areopagite on the stages of soul's development

Dionysius, like Gregory, also refers to the purification as being the first stage in the development of the human soul. But he thinks that for people this process is performed through intermediaries, i. e. through the bodily beings, who are already perfected and so, have the uninterrupted vision of God. He elaborates on this especially in "The Celestial Hierarchy", for example at CH 240C/240D, and 273C. This is what the Syrian avers in the first instance mentioned above: "Similarly, it seems to me, the **immediate** participation in God of those

angels that first raised up to him is more direct then that of those perfected through a mediator. Hence –to use the terminology handed down to us– the first intelligences perfect, illuminate, and purify those of inferior status in such a fashion than the latter, having been lifted up through them to the universal and transcendent source, thereby acquire their due share of the purification, illumination, and perfection of the One who is the source of all perfection"; (CH 240C/240D).¹⁵At CH 273C he says that purification helps "Moving 'upwards' towards' God".¹⁶

Pseudo-Dionysius calls the highest stage of the human development 'darkness' (DN 592CD8; 708D9)¹⁷ because the knowledge achieved at that level is so profound that it escapes description by words; this is also the most intimate human state. Such a level of development is reached through the above-

I use here the following abbreviations for the titles of Dionysius' treatises: EH (for the *Ecclesiastical*

Hierarchy), CH (for the Celestial Hierarchy), MT (for the Mystical Theology, and DN (for the

Divine Names). The quotations will be given as in the critical edition: Corpus Dionysiacum I (DN),

17 Dionysius the Areopagite, "The Divine Names", CD I, edited by B. R. Suchla, pp. 114-115.

¹³ Hans Boersma, *Embodiment and Virtue in Gregory of Nyssa. An Anagogical Approach*, Oxford Early Christian Studies, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013, p. 209 and p. 210.

¹⁴ John McGuckin, "Gregory of Nyssa. Bishop, Philosopher, Exegete, Theologian", in Anna Marmodoro and Neil B. McLynn (eds.), *Exploring Gregory of Nyssa. Philosophical, Theological, and Historical Studies*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018, chapter 1, pp. 7-28. McGuckin is referring to Ann Conway-Jones's book *Gregory of Nyssa's Tabernacle Imagery in its Jewish and Christian Contexts*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014 in ft. 97 on page 24 of his chapter.

¹⁵ Dionysius, "The Celestial Hierarchy", CH 273C, in *CD* II, edited by Günter Heil and Adolf Martin Ritter, Patristische Texte und Studien, vol. 36, Berlin and New York, 1991; the fragment is on pp. 40-41 in Greek; *Corpus Dionysiacum II*; the same fragment in English, *Pseudo-Dionysius: The Complete Works*, edited by Paul Rorem, trans. by P. Rorem and C. Luibheid, Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1987, p. 168; bold letter added.

Edited by Beate Regina Suchla, and *Corpus Dionysiacum II*, eds. Günter Heil and Adolf Martin Ritter, Patristische Texte und Studien, vols. 33 and 36, Berlin and New York, 1990-1991, reprint 2013.

¹⁶ Dionysius the Areopagite, "The Celestial Hierarchy", CH 240C/240D, and 273C in *CD* II, edited by Günter Heil and Adolf Martin Ritter, Patristische Texte und Studien, vol. 36, Berlin and New York, 1991; the fragments are on p. 33, respectively 40-41 in Greek; *Corpus Dionysiacum II*; the same fragment in English, *Pseudo-Dionysius: The Complete Works*, edited by Paul Rorem, trans. by P. Rorem and C. Luibheid, Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1987, pp. 168, respectively p. 174.

mentioned union with the divine.18

He describes this process very clearly in the *Mystical Theology*, where he instructs a young friend how to undergo it:

"Thou then, my friend, if thou desirest $(\eta \hat{v} \chi \theta \omega)$ mystic visions, with strengthened feet abandon thy senses and intellectual operations, and both sensible and invisible things, and both all nonbeing and being; and unknowingly restore thyself to unity as far as possible, unity of Him Who is above all essence and knowledge. And when thou hast transcended thyself and all things in immeasurable and absolute purity of mind, thou shalt ascend to the superessential rays of divine sha-

dows, leaving all behind and freed from ties of all." [MT 997B-1000A].¹⁹

In my own translation, the most important part of this fragment is thus: "If you wish to contemplate God through a mystical experience, my dear Timothy, I advice you to be aware and prepare yourself."

The notion of darkness is also very important because it has implications for the manner in which Gregory of Nyssa and Pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite conceived Trinity. While both thinkers believe that there are three stages in the development of human soul, their position on Trinity varies because they use the term $\hat{\varepsilon}v\omega\sigma\iota\varsigma$ differently: for Nyssen it means unity of persons (a unity within which each of the members of the

¹⁸ Among the publications on this topic see Ysabel de Andia, "Henosis: l'union à Dieu chez Denys l'Aréopagite", *Philosophia Antiqua* 71, Leiden, New York, and Köln: Brill, 1996; D. Turner, *The Darkness of God. Negativity in Christian Mysticism*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998; Deirdre Carabine, *The unknown God: negative theology in the Platonic tradition: Plato to Eriugena*, Louvain: Peeters, W.B. Eerdmans, 1995, and *John Scottus Eriugena*, Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, Great Medieval Thinkers, 2000; Bernard McGinn, *The Foundations of Mysticism. Origins to the Fifth Century*, New York: Crossroads, 1994; and Douglas B. Farrow, "Unification/Henosis", in *Religion Past and Present*, Leiden, Koninklijke Brill NV, Brill Online, April 2011.

¹⁹ Dionysius the Areopagite, "Mystical Theology" 997B-1000A, in "Mystical Theology", *Corpus Dionysiacum II (CH, EH, MT, Letters*), eds. Günter Heil and Adolf Martin Ritter, Patristische Texte und Studien, vol. 36, Berlin and New York, 1991; the fragment is on p. 142.

Here it is in Greek: "Dionysius the Areopagite, Μυστικης Θεολογιας/Mystical Theology, " Έμοὶ μέν οἶν ταῦτα ηῦχθω σὺ δἑ, ὦ φίλε Τιμόθεε, τἦ περὶ τἀ μυστιχά θεάματα συντόνῷ διατριδἦ χαὶ τἀς αἰσθήσεις ἀπόλειπε, χαὶ τἀς νοερἀς ἑνεργείας, χαὶ πἀντα αίσθητἀ χὰὶ νοητἀ, χαὶ πἀντα οὺχ ὄντα χαὶ ὄντα, χαὶ πρὸς τὴν ἕνωσιν, ὡς ἑφιχτὸν, ἀγνώστως ἀνατἀθητι τοῦ ὑπἐρ πᾶσαν οὐσίαν χαὶ γνῶσιν τἦ γἀρ ἑαυτοῦ χαὶ πἀντων ἀσχέτῷ χαὶ ἀπολὺτῷ χαθαρῶς ἑχστἀσει πρὸς τὴν ὑπεροὐσιον τοῦ θείου σχότους ἀχτἶνα, πἀντα ἀφελών χαὶ ἑχ πἀντων ἀπολυθεὶς, ἀναχθήσῃ." (MT 997B -1000A), my translation.

In the translation realized by C. Luibheid the fragment in its entirety says: "For this I pray; and Timothy, my friend, my advice to you as you look for a sight of the mysterious things, is to leave behind you everything perceived and understood, all that is not and all that is, and with your understanding aside, to strive upwards as much as you can toward a union with him who is beyond all being and knowledge. By an undivided and absolute abandonment of yourself and everything, shedding all and freed from all, you will be uplifted to the rays of divine shadows, which is above everything that is"; eds. Heil and Ritter, *Corpus Dionysiacum II*, pp. 68-69; ed. Luibheid, *The Complete Works*, p. 135.

The same fragment was translated (and edited) by Rolt thus: "Such be my prayer; and thee, dear Timothy, I counsel that, in the earnest exercise of mystical contemplation, thou leave the senses and the activities of the intellect and all things in this word of nothingness, or in that world of being, and that, thine understanding being laid to rest, thou strain (so far as thou mayest) towards an union with Him whom neither being nor understanding can contain. For, by the unceasing and absolute renunciation of thyself and all things, thou shalt in pureness cast all things aside, and be released from all, and so shalt be led upwards to the Ray of the Divine Darkness which exceedeth all existence"; ed. Clarence E. Rolt, *The Divine Names & Mystical Theology*, pp. 191-192.

Triune God keep their individuality) while for Ps-Dionysius it means "unity of nature" (the Syrian does not comment on the distinction **of persons**). Ysabel de Andya²⁰ and Endre von Ivánka²¹ emphasize the differentiation between the types of 'union' in Gregory and Pseudo-Areopagite's work.

2. The second aspect that is common to Gregory of Nyssa and Dionysius the Pseudo-Areopagite's theological systems is their attitude towards evil. Gregory thinks that "vice has no inherent existence;"²² i.e. it and the evil behind it do not exist from an ontological point of view; it is just the lack of good. He speaks about it not only within "Ora-

tio Catechetica", but also in the "De Anima et Resurrectione"²³ and "De Virginitate",²⁴ where he paraphrases Plato's *Phaedrus* and *Phaedo*, especially the latter.²⁵ The Cappadocian believed that people "could decide in favour of evil, which cannot have its origin in the Divine will, but only in our inner selves where it arises in the form of a deviation from good, and so it is a privation of it;"²⁶ Or. *Cath.*: 24C. It is so because of the freedom with which human beings were endowed when created.

Dionysius articulates the same thought. He states that evil "comes into being not on its own account" but, paradoxically, "for the

²⁰ Ysabel de Andia, "Henosis: l'union à Dieu chez Denys l'Aréopagite", *Philosophia Antiqua* 71, Leiden, New York, and Köln: Brill, 1996.

²¹ Endre von Ivánka, *Plato christianus. Übernahme und Umgestaltung des Platonismus durch die Väter* [How the Fathers adopted and transformed Platonism], Einsiedeln: Johannes Verlag, 1964.

²² Gregory of Nyssa, for example in "Oratio Catechetica", PG 45 (1863): 24C; "The Great Catechism", in *Dogmatic Treatises, Select Writings and Letters* translated and edited by Henry Wace and Philip Schaff, A Selected Library of Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers (NPNF), second series, 14 vols., Oxford and New York, 1893, V, p. 474; see also 25A, NPNF p. 480.

²³ Gregory of Nyssa, "De Anima et Resurrectione", in GNO 15, Werner Jaeger; consulted online on 21 August 2019 <<u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/2214-8728_gnoo_aGNO_15_b</u>Leiden: Brill, c. 2019; Gregory of Nyssa, "De anima et Resurrectione inscribitur Macrinia dialogus", in J.-P. Migne, *Patrologiae cursus completus (series Graeca)*, Paris: Imprimerie Catholique vol. 46, 1863, cols. 11-161; translated as *On the Soul and the Resurrection* by William Moore and Henry Austin Wilson, in Philip Schaff and Henry Wace (eds.), Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers, Second Series, vol. 5, pp. 596-597 (p. 436 in the first series??). Nyssen has another text about Resurrection (of Christ): "In Christi Resurrectionem Oratio Quinque", J-P. Migne, *Patrologia Graeca* 44, Paris: Imprimerie Catholique, 1863, cols. 599-690.

²⁴ Gregory of Nyssa, "De Virginitate", *Gregorii Nysseni Opera Online* 8; Werner Jaeger; consulted online on 21 August 2019 <<u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/2214-8728_gnoo_aGNO_15_t></u> Leiden: Brill, c. 2019. In a particular quotation in this dialogue, at GNO 8.1. 332, there are clear allusions to Plato's *Phaedrus* (246-247)], and *Phaedo*. In *Phaedo* 107d it is written: "Since the soul is seen to be immortal, it cannot escape from evil or be saved in any other way than by becoming as good and wise as possible. For the soul takes to the other world nothing but its *paideia* and nurture, and these are said to benefit or injure the departed greatly."

²⁵ Gregory of Nyssa, "De Anima et Resurrectione", in GNO 15, Werner Jaeger; consulted online on 21 August 2019 <<u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/2214-8728_gnoo_aGNO_15_t></u>Leiden: Brill, c. 2019; Gregory of Nyssa, "De anima et Resurrectione inscribitur Macrinia dialogus", in J.-P. Migne, *Patrologiae cursus completus (series Graeca)*, Paris: Imprimerie Catholique vol. 46, 1863, cols. 11-161; translated as *On the Soul and the Resurrection* by William Moore and Henry Austin Wilson, in Philip Schaff and Henry Wace (eds.), Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers, Second Series, vol. 5, pp. 596-597 (p. 436 in the first series??). Nyssen has another text about Resurrection (of Christ): "In Christi Resurrectionem Oratio Quinque", J-P. Migne, *Patrologia Graeca* 44, Paris: Imprimerie Catholique, 1863, cols. 599-690.

²⁶ Gregory of Nyssa, for example in "Oratio Catechetica", PG 45: 24C; "The Great Catechism", in *Dogmatic Treatises, Select Writings and Letters* translated and edited by Henry Wace and Philip Schaff, A Selected Library of Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers (NPNF), second series, 14 vols. (Oxford and New York), 1893, V; p. 479; emphasis added.

sake of the Good"; it exists "as an accident [...] by means of something else".²⁷ Therefore, for the Syrian it means that evil is initially a 'good' that weakens.

For the Syrian evil has neither "inherence in things that have being" (DN 733D) nor "substance" or "place" because "its origin is due to a defect rather than to a capacity"(DN 733C). In some places the Syriac thinker surprisingly avers that the evil still aspires to the Good, and exemplifies his statement by specifying that demons desire "existence", "life" and "understanding"; they "are evil in so far as they have fallen away from the virtues proper to them." But he also explains that: "desire for what has no being [in those who sin] is proportionate to [its] lack of desire for the Good. Indeed this latter is not so much a desire as a sin against real desire" (DN 733D).

Moreover, Dionysius indicates that there are people who in spite of knowing the content of biblical precepts do not act in accordance with them due to their weak will. In some cases, the "will is so perverse" that people "do not want to know how to do good" (736A). Because of this, among other definitions of evil, one could be that it is "a deficiency of knowledge [...], of desire" or "an error of real desire"; the Areopagite seems to believe that these two possible ways for evil to arise from the will are synonymous. Since for Dionysius ignorance is, as we have observed, one of the causes of evil, it is logical to assume that, by understanding things clearly, one can turn to the Good.

Ysabel de Andia comments on the abovementioned passage in the *Ecclesiastical Hierarchy* (EH 392A) which concerns the candidate for a deep spiritual life by noticing that for the Syrian it is precisely up to the human will to accept or not the gift of deification that comes from the "Divine Goodness". The extent to which this process takes place depends on the individual capacity to receive the "gift".

Bibliography

Primary sources:

Dionysius the Areopagite, *Corpus Dionysiacum I (The Divine Names)*, edited by Beate Regina Suchla, Berlin, New York, 1990

Dionysius the Areopagite, *Corpus Dionysiacum II (CH, EH, MT, Letters*), eds. Günter Heil and Adolf Martin Ritter, Berlin, New York, 1991

Dionysius the Areopagite, *Pseudo-Dionysius: The Complete Works*, edited by Colm Luibheid and Paul Rorem, New York, 1987

²⁷ Dionysius the Areopagite, DN 732C, Corpus Dionysiacum I (1990), p. 177; The Complete Works (1987), p. 94.

Dionysius the Areopagite, *Patrologia Graeca*, J. P. Migne (ed.), Paris: Imprimerie Catholique, 1860, vols. 3-4

Gregory of Nyssa, St., De hominis opificio, in J.-P. Migne (ed.), Patrologiae Graeca, Paris, 1863, vol. 44,

Gregory of Nyssa, *On the Making of Man* [Humankind], in H. Wace and P. Schaff (eds.), *A Selected Library of Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers: Dogmatic Treatises, Select Writings and Letters*, second series, vol. 5 (NPNF 2-05), trans. W. Moore and H. A. Wilson (also Prolegomena, notes, and indices), Oxford and New York, 1893

Gregory of Nyssa, St., "To Ablabius. That there are Not Three Gods", in H. Wace and P. Schaff (eds.), NPNF 2-05, Oxford, New York, 1893, 331-336

Gregory of Nyssa, "De anima et Resurrectione inscribitur Macrinia dialogus", in J.-P. Migne, *Patrologiae Graeca*, vol. 46, Paris, 1863, cols. 11-161

Gregory of Nyssa, "On the Soul and the Resurrection", in H. Wace and P. Schaff (eds.), NPNF 2-05, trans. W. Moore and H. A. Wilson (also Prolegomena, notes, and indices), Oxford and New York, 1893, 428-468

Gregory of Nyssa On the Soul and the Resurrection, trans. C. P. Roth. Crestwood, NY, 1993, reprint 2000

Gregory of Nyssa, "De anima et resurrection in Gregory of Nyssa", *Gregorii Nysseni Opera: Opera dogmatica minora*, Pars III, edited by A. Spira, W. Brinker, and E. Mühlenberg, Leiden, Boston, vols. 3/3, 2014

Gregory of Nyssa, "De Anima et Resurrectione", in E. Mülenberg and G. Maspero (eds.), *Gregorii Nysseni Opera Online*, general editor Werner Jaeger, consulted online on 22 June 2020 <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/2214-8728_gnoo_aGNO_15_t</u>, Leiden, c. 2019

Gregory of Nyssa, "Commentary on the Song of Songs", trans. C. McCambley, Brookline, 1987

Gregory of Nyssa, *Homilies on the Song of songs*, trans., Introduction and notes by R. A. Norris Jr., in J. T. Fitzgerald (gen. ed.), *Writings from the Greco-Roman World* 13, Atlanta, 2012

Gregory of Nyssa//Gregorii Nysseni, E. Mülenberg and G. Maspero (eds.), *In canticum canticorum, Gre-gorii Nysseni Opera Online*, vol. 24; general editor W. Jaeger, consulted online on 22 June 2020, http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/2214-8728_gnoo_aGNO_24_t

Gregory of Nyssa "Contra Eunomium libri I et II", edited by W. Jaeger, *Gregorii Nysseni Opera* 1, Leiden, 2002

Gregory of Nyssa, "On Perfection", in *Saint Gregory of Nyssa: Ascetical Works*, in V. Woods Callahan (trans.), Fathers of the Church 58, Washington DC, 1967, 93-124

Gregory of Nyssa *The Life of Moses*, in A. J. Malherbe and E. Ferguson (trans.), The Classics of Western Spirituality, Mahwah, NJ, 1991

Gregory of Nyssa, *Gregorii* Nysseni, "De Vita Moysis pentecosten", in E. Mülenberg and G. Maspero (eds.), *Gregorii Nysseni Opera Online*, vol. 25, general editor W. Jaeger, consulted online on 22 June 2020 http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/2214-8728_gnoo_aGNO_25_t. Leiden, c. 2019

Gregory of Nyssa, "Vitae Sanctae Macrinae", edited by V. W. Callahan in J. W. Jaeger (ed.), *Gregorii Nysseni Opera*, 8. 1, Leiden, 1952, 370-414

Gregory of Nyssa, Hexameron liber, in J.-P. Migne, Patrologiae Graeca, Paris, vol. 44, 1863, cols. 69A-71B

Gregory of Nyssa "Contra Eunomium liber III", edited by W. Jaeger, GNO 2, Leiden, 2002.

Gregory of Nyssa "In Inscriptiones Psalmorum. In Sextum Psalmum: In Ecclesiasten Homiliae", edited by J. McDonough and P. Alexander, *GNO* 5, Leiden, 1986

Gregory of Nyssa, "Opera ascetica et Epistulae", pars 1, ed. W. Jaeger and J.P. Cavarnos, trans. V.W. Callahan, *GNO* 8/1, Leiden, 1986

Gregory of Nyssa/Gregorii Nysseni, "De Virginitate", *Gregorii Nysseni Opera*, edited by J. P. Cavarnos, general editor W. Jaeger, vol. 8/1, Leiden, 1952, 217-343

Gregory of Nyssa, "On Virginity", in H. Wace and P. Schaff (eds.), NPNF 2-05, trans. W. Moore and H. A. Wilson (also Prolegomena, notes, and indices), Oxford, New York, 1893

Gregory of Nyssa, "De Vita Macrini", ed. W. Jaeger, GNO 8/1, Leiden, 1986, 370-414

Gregory of Nyssa, "De Vita Moysis", edited by W. Jaeger, GNO 7. 1, Leiden, 1991

Gregory of Nyssa, *The Life of St. Moses*, edited by H. Musurillo, trans. A. J. Malherbe and E. Ferguson, Classics of Western Spirituality, New York: Paulist Press, 1978

Gregory of Nyssa?/Basil Magni? (1857) "Epistula XXXVIII. Gregorio fratri de discrimine essentiae et hypostasis", edited by J.P. Migne, PG 32, columns 325-340.

Gregory of Nyssa, "Letters", in H. Wace and P. Schaff (eds.), NPNF 2-05, trans. W. Moore and H. A. Wilson (also Prolegomena, notes, and indices), Oxford, New York, 1893.

Gregorius Nyssenus, "Sermones de Creatione Hominis", in Opera supplementum, Leiden, 1972.

Gregory of Nyssa, *Gregorii Nysseni Opera Online*, edited by W. Jaeger Brill Online, 2014; Oxford University libraries. 24 November 2014; http://referenceworks.brillonline.com/entries/gregorii-nysseni-opera/de-anima-et-resurrectione-aGNO_15_t.

Gregory of Nyssa, "Opera ascetica et Epistulae", edited by G. Pasquali, pars 2, *Gregorii Nysseni Opera*, Leiden, vol. 8/2, 2002.

Grégoire de Nysse, La Vie de Moise, edited and trans. by *Jean Daniélou*, Sources Chrétiennes Paris: Éditions du Cerf, third edition 1968, first edition 1955

Migne, J.P., Patrologiae Graecae 44, Paris, 1863

Gregory of Nyssa, *The Life of Moses*, trans. and edited by Abraham J. Malhherbe and Everett Ferguson, Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1978, reprint London, New York: Harper Collins Publishers, 2006

Plato, Complete Works, edited by J. M. Cooper and D. S. Hutchinson, Indianopolis, Cambridge, 1997

Plato, *The Collected Dialogues of Plato*, edited by E.Hamilton and Huntington Cairnes, trans. P. Shorey, Bollingen Series 71; Princeton, NJ, 1985

Plotinus, *The Enneads*, revised by B. S. Page, edited (revised), and trans. by Stephen MacKenna, Preface by E. R. Dodds, Introduction by Paul Henry S. J., the fourth edition, with Foreword by E. R. Dodds; London: Faber and Faber, 1969

Proclus, The Elements of Theology, ed. and trans. E.R. Dodds, Oxford, 1963, reprint 1992

Porphyry, "On the Life of Plotinus and the Arrangement of His Work", in Plotinus, *The Enneads*, revised by B. S. Page, edited (revised), and trans. by Stephen MacKenna, Preface by E. R. Dodds, Introduction by Paul Henry S. J., the fourth edition, with Foreword by E. R. Dodds; London: Faber and Faber, 1969

Secondary sources:

Andia, Y. de, *Denys l'aréopagite et sa postérité en Orient et en Occident*, Paris: Institut d'Études Augustiniennes, 1997

Andia, Y. de, *Henosis: l'union à Dieu chez Denys l'Aréopagite*, Leiden-New York-Köln: Brill, coll. Philosophia Antiqua 71, 1996

Andia, Y. de, *Denys l'aréopagite et sa postérité en Orient et en Occident*, Paris: Institut d'Études Augustiniennes, 1997

Andia, Y. de, "Homo Vivens: incorruptibilité et divinization de l'homme selon Irenée de Lyon", Paris: Institut d'Études Augustiniennes, Paris, 1986, repr. 1994

Battisti, G. S., 'Strutture e figure retoriche nel "de Caelesti Hierarchia" dello Pseudo-Dionigi: Un mezzo di espressione dell' ontologia Neoplatonica,' *Archivio di Filosofia* (1983), 51: 293–319

Beggiani, S. J., "Theology at the Service of Mysticism: Method in Pseudo-Dionysius", *Theological Studies* (1996), 57: 201–223

Brons, B., *Gott und die Seienden. Untersuchungen zum Verhaltnis von neuplatonischer Metaphysik and christlicher Tradition bei Dionysius Areopagita* [God and Beings: An Examination of the Relationship between Neoplatonist Metaphysics and Christian Tradition in Dionysius the Areopagite], Gottingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1976

Cacciari, Massimo, The necessary angel, New York: State New York University Press, 1994

Carabine, D., *The Unknown God: Negative Theology in the Platonic Tradition: Plato to Eriugena*, Louvain: Peeters, 1995

Coakley, S. and C. M. Stang (eds.), Re-thinking Dionysius, Oxford: Wiley Blackwell, 2009

Corrigan, K., "Solitary" mysticism in Plotinus, Proclus, Gregory of Nyssa, and Pseudo-Dionysius,' *The Journal of Religion*, 1996, 28-42

Decock, P.B, "Origen's theological and mystical approach to the Scriptures in the introduction to his commentary on John's Gospel", *Die Skriflig*, 1 June 2011, vol. 45 (2&3), 673-688

Di Berardino, A., Patrology, Cambridge, UK: J. Clarke, 2006

Dillon, J. M., and S. Klitenic Wear, *Dionysius the Areopagite and the Neoplatonist Tradition: Despoiling the Hellenes*, Ashgate: Aldershote, 2007

Dionysius the Areopagite, *Corpus Dionysiacum I: Pseudo-Dionysius Areopagita. De divinis nominibus/The Divine Names* edited by Beate Regina Suchla, Patristische Texte und Studien 33, Berlin, New York: De Gruyter, 1990, reprint 2013 and as vol. 62, 2011

Dionysius the Areopagite, *Corpus Dionysiacum II: Pseudo-Dionysius Areopagita De coelesti hierarchia, De ecclesiastica hierarchia, De mystica theologia, Epistulae*, edited by Günter Heil and Adolf Martin Ritter, Patristische Texte und Studien 36, Berlin, New York: De Gruyter 1991, reprint 2014 and as vol. 67, 2012

Dionysius the Areopagite, *Corpus Dionysiacum IV/1: Ioannis Scythopolitani Prologus et Scholia in Dionysii Areopagitae librum 'De divinis nominibus' cum additamentis interpretum aliorum*, edited by Beate Regina Suchla, Patristische Texte und Studien 62, Berlin: De Gruyter, 2011

Dionysius the Areopagite, *The Ecclesiastical Hierarchy*, edited by Th. L. Campbell, Washington, D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 1984

Dionysius the Areopagite, *Dionigi Areopagita, Nomi divini, Teologia mistica, Epistole: La versione siriaca di Sergio di Rēš'ayna (VI secolo)*, edited and trans. Emiliano Fiori, CSCO, vol. 656, Sriptores Syri, tomus 252 (text), CSCO vol. 657, Sriptores Syri, tomus 253, Leuven: Peeters, 2014

Dionysius the Areopagite, *Pseudo-Dionysius: The Complete Works*, edited and translated by Colm Luibhéid and Paul Rorem; René Roques, Jaroslav Pelikan, Jean Leclercq, and Karlfried Froehlich (introductions), London: SPCK and New York, NY and Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1987

Dell'Acqua, F., 'L'auctoritasdello pseudo-Dionigi e Sugerio di Saint-Denis', *Studi Medievali*, 2014, Serie Terza, Anno iV, Fasc. I, pp. 189-215

Dionysius the Areopagite, *Pseudo-Dionysius: The Divine Names and Mystical Theology*, trans. J. Jones, Milwaukee, WI: Marquette University Press, 1980

Downey, G., 'Ekphrasis', in T. Klausner (ed.), *Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum*, Stuttgart: Hiersmann, 1959, vol. 4, 921–944

Duclow, D. F., 'Isaiah meets the seraph: Breaking ranks in Dionysius and Eriugena?' *Eriugena: East and West*, Notre Dame: Notre Dame University Press, 1994, 233–252

Dusenbury, D., L., The Space of Time, Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2014

Edwards, M. J. and E. Ene D-Vasilescu, Visions of God and ideas on deification in Patristic Thought (coed.); Routledge/Taylor & Francis, 2016

Ene D-Vasilescu, E., "If you wish to contemplate God': Pseudo-Dionysius on the notion of will", *Studia Patristica*, vol. C, 2020: 247-257

Ene D-Vasilescu, E., "Pseudo-Dionysius, a Statue, and the concept of Beauty", in the *International Journal of Orthodox Theology* 10:1 (2019), pp. 72-117

Favier, J., J. James, and Y. Flamand, *The World of Chartres* (New York: Henry N. Abrams, London: Thames and Hudson, 1990, 168–173

Faraggiana di Sarzana, Chiara 'Il Nomocanon Par. Gr.1330, "horride rescrip-tus" su pergamene in maiuscola contenenti un antico commentario ad Aristotele, il Corpus Dionysiacum e testi patristici', *Nea Rhome* 6, 2009, 192–225

Finan, T. and Twomey, V. (eds.), *The Relationship Between Neoplatonism and Christianity*, Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1992

Gersh, S. E., From Iamblichus to Eriugena. An Investigation of the Prehistory and Evolution of the Pseudo-Dyonisian Tradition, Leiden: Brill, 1978

Hathaway, R. F., *Hierarchy and the Definition of Order in the Letters of Pseudo-Dionysius. A study in the form and meaning of the Pseudo-Dionysian writings*, The Hague: Nijhoff, 1970

Jones, D. A., Angels: A History, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010

Jones, D. A., Very Short Introduction about angels, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011

Leight-Choate, T. A. L., *Liturgical Faces of Saint Denis: Music, Power and Identity in Medieval France*; PhD dissertation, Yale University, New Haven, 2009

Lilla, S., 'Note sulla Gerarchia Celeste dello Ps. Dionigi l'Areopagita', Augustinianum 26, 1986, 519-573

Louth, A., *The Origins of the Christian Mystical Tradition. From Plato to Denis*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, the second edition, 2007

Marion, J.-L., Dieu sans l'être: Hors-texte, Paris: Librairie Arthème Fayard, 1982

Marion, J.-L., L'idole et la distance, Paris: Editions Bernard Grasset, 1977

Mazzucchi, C. M., 'Damascio, autore del Corpus Dionysiacum e il dialogo Peri Politikes Epistemos', Ae-

vum: Rassegna di scienze storiche linguistiche e filologiche 80, no. 2, 2006, pp. 299-335

McGinn, B., The Foundations of Mysticism. Origins to the Fifth Century, New York: Crossroads, 1994

Origen, *On First Principles*, translation and notes by G. W. Butterworth; Introduction to the TORCH edition Henri de Lubac, Gloucester, Massachusetts: Peter Smith Publishers, 1973

Origen, On First Principles, edited and translated by John Behr, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017, vols. 1-2

Parry, K. (ed.), The Wiley Blackwell Companion to Patristics, Wiley Blackwell, on-line, 2015

Parry, K. (ed.), The Blackwell Companion to Eastern Christianity, Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2010

Proclus, *The Elements of Theology*, edited by E.R. Dodds, Oxford: Clarendon Press; 1963 1992 (second edition), reprinted 2014)

Pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite/Pseudo-Denys l'Aréopagite, Oeuvres complètes. Traduction, préface et note, Paris: Aubier, 1980

Pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite/Pseudo-Dionysius Areopagita. Die Namen Gottes, trans. B. R. Suchla, Stuttgart: Hiersemann, 1988

Pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite/Pseudo-Dionysius Areopagita. Uber die mystische Theologie und Briefe, Stuttgart: Hiersemann, 1994

Pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite, *The Divine Names and Mystical Theology*, ed. and trans. C. E. Rolt, London: SPCK, 1983

Riordan, W., Divine Light: The Theology of Denys the Areopagite, San Francisco: Ignatius, 2008

Rist, J. M., "Pseudo-Dionysius, Neoplatonism, and the Weakness of the Soul", in H. J. Westra (ed.), *From Athens to Chartres: Neoplatonism and Medieval Thought*, Leiden: Brill, 1992

Rist, J. M., "A note on Eros and Agape in Ps-Dionysius", Vigiliae Christianae 20 (1966)

Rorem, P. E., *Pseudo-Dionysius. A Commentary on the Text and an Introduction to their influence*, Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press, 1993

Rorem, P. E. and J. C. Lamoreaux, *John of Scythopolis and the Dionysian Corpus: Annotating the Areopagite*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998

Rorem, P. E., *Biblical and Liturgical Symbols within the Pseudo-Dionysian Synthesis*, Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 1984

Rorem, P. E., 'The Uplifting Spirituality of Pseudo-Dionysius', in B. McGinn and J. Meyendorff (eds.), Christian Spirituality: Origins to the Twelfth Century, London: Routledge, 1986, pp. 132-151

Rorem, P. E., "Moses as the Paradigm for the Liturgical Spirituality of Pseudo-Dionysius", in *Studia Patristica*, vol. 12/2, 1982, pp. 275-281

Rorem, P. E., "The place of the Mystical Theology in the Pseudo- Dionysian Corpus", *Dionysius* 4 (1980): 87-98

Rorem, P. E., "Iamblichus and the Anagogical Method in Pseudo- Dionysius' Liturgical Theology", *Studia Patristica* 18 (1979): 453-460

Roques, R., "Symbolisme et theologie negative chez le Pseudo-Denys", *Bulletin de l'association Guillaume, Budé*, 1957

Saffrey H. D., *Proclus et la théologie platonicienne: actes du Colloque international de Louvain*, 13-16 mai 1998: en l'honneur de H. D. Saffrey et L. G. Westerink, Leuven: Leuven University Press; Paris: Les Belles lettres, 2000

Saffrey H. D., 'New Objective Links between the Pseudo-Dionysius and Proclus', in D. J. O'Meara (ed.), *Neoplatonism and Christian Thought*, Norfolk, VA: International Society for Neoplatonic Studies, 1982, 65–74; reprinted in French as "Nouveaux liens objectifs entre le Pseudo-Denys et Proclus", in H. D. Saffrey, *Recherches sur le néoplatonisme après Plotin*, Paris: J. Vrin, 1990

Saffrey H. D. and L. G. Westerink, *Proclus. Théologie* platonicienne. *Livre III. Introduction*, ch. 1. *La doctrine des hénades divines chez Proclus: origine et signification*, IX-LXXVII, Paris: Les Belles lettres, 1978

Sheldon-Williams, I. P., "Henads and Angels: Proclus and the ps.-Dionysius", *Studia Patristica* 11, (1972): 65–71

Speer, A. (ed.), Zwischen Kunsthandwerk und Kunst: Die 'Schedula diversarum artium', Berlin/Boston: Walter De Gruyter [2013]

Sugerius/S. Dionysii, "Scriptum consecrationis ecclesiae Sancti Dionysii", in Suger, *Oeuvres*, I, *Écrit sur la consécration de Saint-Denis, L'oeuvre administrative, Histoire de Louis VII*, edited and translated by F. Gasparri, Paris, 1996

Suger, Abt Suger von Saint-Denis ausgewählte Schriften: Ordinatio, De consecratione, De administratione, edited and translated by Andreas Speer and Günther Binding, Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 2005, 2008

Perczel, I., "The earliest Syriac reception of Dionysius", in Sarah Coakley and Charles M. Stang (eds.), *Re-thinking Dionysius*, Oxford: Wiley–Blackwell, 2009, 27–42

Perczel I., "God as Monad and Henad: Dionysius the Areopagite and the Peri Archon", in L. Perrone (ed.), Origeniana octava: Origen and the Alexandrian tradition/Origene e la tradizione alessandrina papers of the 8th International Origen Congress, Pisa, 27-31 August 2001, Leuven: Leuven University Press; 2003, 1193-1209

Perczel, I., "Pseudo-Dionysius and the Platonic theology", in Proclus et la théologie platonicienne: actes du

Colloque International de Louvain (13 – 16 mai 1998) en l'Honneur de H. D. Saffrey et L. G. Westerink, Leuven: Leuven University Press; Paris: Belles lettres, 2000, 491-532

Perczel, I., "Le pseudo-Denys, lecteur d'Origène", in W. A. Bienert, U. Kühneweg (eds.), Origeniana septima: Origenes in den auseinandersetzungen des 4 jahrhunderts, Leuven: Leuven University Press, 1999, pp. 673-710

Perczel I., "Une théologie de la lumière: Denys l'Aréopagite et Evagre le Pontique", *Revue des Etudes Augustiniennes*, 1999; 45(1):79-120

Perczel, I., "Theodoret of Cyrrhus: the main source of Pseudo-Dionysius' Christology", paper at the Seventh International Conference on Patristic Studies, August 2015

Perl, E. D., Theophany: The Neoplatonic Philosophy of Dionysius the Areopagite, Albany: SUNY, 2008

Stang, C. M., *Apophasis and Pseudonymity in Dionysius the Areopagite: "No Longer I"*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012

Stang, C. M., "Negative Theology from Gregory of Nyssa to Dionysius the Areopagite", in Julia Lamm (ed.), *The Wiley-Blackwell Companion to Christian Mysticism*, Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012, pp. 161–176

Turner, D., *The Darkness of God. Negativity in Christian Mysticism*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998